ORIGINAL ARTICLE Asthma and Rhinitis

Asthma and allergy development: contrasting influences of yeasts and other fungal exposures

B. Behbod¹, J. E. Sordillo², E. B. Hoffman^{1,3,4}, S. Datta², T. E. Webb², D. L. Kwan², J. A. Kamel², M. L. Muilenberg⁵, J. A. Scott⁶, G. L. Chew⁷, T. A. E. Platts-Mills⁸, J. Schwartz¹, B. Coull¹, H. Burge¹ and D. R. Gold^{1,2}

¹Harvard School of Public Health, Boston, MA, USA, ²Channing Laboratory, Boston, MA, USA, ³TIMI Study Group, Brigham and Women's Hospital, Boston, MA, USA, ⁴Harvard Medical School, Boston, MA, USA, ⁵University of Massachusetts, Amherst, MA, USA, ⁶Dalla Lana School of Public Health, University of Toronto, Toronto, ON, Canada, ⁷Mailman School of Public Health, Columbia University, New York, NY, USA and ⁸University of Virginia, Charlottesville, VA, USA

Clinical **Experimental Allergy**

Summary

Background Infancy is a developmental stage with heightened susceptibility to environmental influences on the risk of chronic childhood disease. Few birth cohort studies have detailed measures of fungal diversity data in infants' bedrooms, limiting the potential to measure long-term associations of these complex exposures with development of asthma or allergy.

Objective We evaluated the relation of home fungal levels in infancy to repeated measures of wheeze and development of asthma and rhinitis by age 13, and sensitization by age 12 years.

Methods In the Epidemiology of Home Allergens and Asthma prospective birth cohort study, we recruited 408 children with family history of allergic disease or asthma. When children were aged 2-3 months, we measured culturable fungi in bedroom air and dust, and in outdoor air. Main outcomes included ascertainment of symptoms/disease onset by questionnaire from birth through age 13. We estimated hazard ratios and, for wheeze and sensitization, odds ratios for an interquartile increase in log-transformed fungal concentrations, adjusting for other outcome predictors and potential confounders.

Results Elevated levels of yeasts in bedroom floor dust were associated with reduced: i) wheeze at any age; ii) fungal sensitization; and iii) asthma development by age 13 (hazard ratio (HR) = 0.86; 95% confidence interval (CI), [0.75 to 0.98]). Outdoor airborne Cladosporium and dustborne Aspergillus predicted increased rhinitis. Risk of fungal sensitization by age 12, in response to environmental Alternaria and Aspergillus, was elevated in children with a maternal history of fungal sensitization.

Conclusions and Clinical Relevance Despite the irritant and allergenic properties of fungi, early-life elevated dust yeast exposures or their components may be protective against allergy and asthma in children at risk for these outcomes. Ascertainment of fungal components associated with immunoprotective effects may have therapeutic relevance for asthma.

Keywords allergy, asthma, children, damp, development, fungi, housing, indoor, infants, mould, outdoor, rhinitis, wheeze, yeast

Submitted 28 January 2014; revised 19 July 2014; accepted 5 August 2014

Correspondence:

Behrooz Behbod, Harvard School of Public Health, 401 Park Drive West, Boston, MA 02215, USA. E-mail: bbehbod@post.harvard.edu Cite this as: B. Behbod, J. E. Sordillo, E. B. Hoffman, S. Datta, T. E. Webb, D. L. Kwan, J. A. Kamel, M. L. Muilenberg, J. A. Scott, G. L. Chew, T. A. E. Platts-Mills, J. Schwartz, B. Coull, H. Burge, D. R. Gold. Clinical & Experimental Allergy, 2015 (45) 154-163.

Introduction

Infancy is a susceptible period when exposures may alter the risk of chronic childhood disease [1]. Children spend most of their time indoors [2], where they may be exposed to damp conditions and mould. A

meta-analysis of eight European birth cohort studies found that living in visibly damp homes in early life was associated with asthma development and rhinitis symptoms by age 10 [3]. Indoor dampness may favour microbial growth and cause greater exposure to fungi but also endotoxin and dust mites [4], and older studies

of home dampness did not differentiate the individual biologic components responsible for the link between dampness and risk of asthma or allergic disease [5].

Few birth cohort studies [6-8] collect detailed data on fungi in infant bedrooms with sufficient follow-up beyond early childhood to measure long-term associations of these complex exposures with subsequent asthma or allergy. While studies of fungal exposures and infant wheeze are mostly focused on adverse outcomes, a small body of literature on fungal components [6, 9–13] and wheeze risk suggest that exposure to some fungal derivatives or certain species [14] may exert protective effects.

In the Boston, Massachusetts Epidemiology of Home Allergens and Asthma prospective birth cohort study of children with parental history of asthma, hay fever or allergy, we evaluated the relation of elevations in infancy (age 2-3 months) culturable fungal and visible home dampness exposures to repeated measures of wheeze and the development of asthma and rhinitis and sensitization by 12-13 years of age.

Methods

Study protocol

Between September 1994 and June 1996, we recruited 505 children (including six sets of twins) who had at least one parent with hay fever, asthma, or allergies. The recruitment and written informed consent process has been described elsewhere [15]. Of the 499 children followed up to age one, 408 had both home indoor air and dust fungal measurements, with complete data for time to first onset of asthma and multiple wheeze assessments. Of the 408 children, 406 had complete data for time to first onset of rhinitis and indoor fungal measurements; 265 had complete data for mould sensitization and fungal measurements. The study was approved by the Institutional Review Board of Brigham and Women's Hospital (ethical approval number BWH 1999P001575).

Early-life fungal exposure assessment has been described previously [16]. We collected airborne fungal propagules for 1 min at 45 lpm using a Burkard Portable Culture Plate Air Sampler (Burkard Mfg. Co., Rickmansworth, UK) loaded with dichloran glycerol agar (DG18) [17]. Outdoor air was sampled 3 m from the main entrance, and provided temperatures were >36°F (2.2°C). We sampled indoor air 1–1.5 m above the area of the bedroom floor demarcated for dust collection. After air sampling, we collected dust for 5 min from 2 m² of the bedroom floor where the infant slept using a standard portable vacuum (Eureka MightyMite, Peoria, IL, USA), modified with a cellulose dust-collection thimble and culturable fungi were recovered using a dilution series of suspended dust inoculated onto DG18. After

room-temperature incubation, all recovered fungal colonies were identified to genus level using standard mycologic criteria [18, 19]. Yeasts were identified only as such and not further characterized. Yeasts are difficult to identify to genus level (when grown in only one culture medium), so they were classified as a single group.

Definition of fungal and dampness predictors

Fungal distributions were skewed and were therefore natural log (ln)-transformed and treated as continuous variables. Total fungi concentrations represent a count of all fungal genera that we identified, including rare taxa. Our working definition for 'rare' was not measurable at the 75th percentile. While included in our count of total fungi, these rare taxa were not considered in our analyses as individual predictors of health outcomes. Most of the individual fungal taxa that we considered as exposures were fungi that (a) we evaluated sensitization to and (b) that we had identified as predictors of early-life respiratory outcomes in our cohort [16, 20]. We classified exposures as [1] individual genus and [2] 'total fungi' (sum of concentrations for all detectable fungi from each location).

Following home dampness variables were dichotomized: [1] parent-reported visible mould, water damage, or dampness over the year prior to our 2-3 month home visit; and annually assessed parental reports of: (2a) visible mould, water damage, or home dampness; or (2b) water damage in the home or standing water on the basement floor over the past year, until the subject children were 13 years old.

Definition of other covariates

We adjusted regression models for potential confounders and independent predictors of our outcomes, as reported in previous publications [4, 15, 21–32]. We did not adjust for active or environmental tobacco smoke exposure, as each was rarely reported in our cohort (<1%).

We ascertained maternal sensitivity with serum IgE at birth, which has been described elsewhere [33]. Mothers were described as having 'mould atopy' if sensitized to Alternaria or Aspergillus species, and 'any atopy' if sensitized to ≥1 allergen (mould, cat, dog, ragweed, ryegrass, cockroach, or dust mite), and/or a total IgE ≥200 IU/mL [33].

Definition of outcome variables

After written informed consent was obtained, trained research assistants administered a telephone questionnaire to the child's primary caregiver every 2 months, beginning when the child was 2 months old and until

the second birthday. Between ages 2 and 13 years, wheeze and asthma were ascertained semi-annually, while allergic rhinitis was assessed annually. For comparability across outcomes, we used a summarized annual assessment, asking whether the child had experienced each outcome over the past year.

A positive wheeze report was defined as ≥ 1 wheeze episode at any time over the prior year. Secondarily, we categorized wheeze into three age stages as follows: (i) <3 years; (ii) ≥ 3 and <6 years; and (iii) ≥ 6 years, similar to the asthma phenotypes described by Stein *et al.* [34].

A child was reported to have current (active) asthma if the parent reported a physician's diagnosis of asthma, along with any wheeze symptoms (including with cold air or exercise) in the past year. Current (active) rhinitis was defined as a parental report of physician-diagnosed hay fever and nasal symptoms (runny nose) in the past year.

At ages 7 and 12 years, we ascertained mould sensitization status. A child was defined as mould sensitive by age 12 if they had a positive skin test (\geq 3 mm wheal size) or radioallergosorbent test (RAST; Immunoglobulin E (IgE) level \geq 0.35 U/mL) to \geq 1 of the following genera: *Alternaria*, *Cladosporium*, *Aspergillus*, or *Penicillium*. If missing, we assigned sensitization status based on their age 7 results.

Statistical analysis

We examined the relationship between early-life fungal exposure and respiratory/allergic disease outcomes longitudinally. To determine whether fungal exposures were associated with time to onset of asthma or rhinitis, we used Cox proportional hazards regression [35]. For the repeated wheeze outcome, we implemented generalized estimating equations (GEE) [36] with exchangeable correlation structures, and inverse probability weighting (IPW) to account for loss to follow-up [37]. We also assessed whether annual reports of home dampness predicted wheeze in the same year or in the following year. To assess the relationship between exposures (including maternal fungal sensitization) and mould sensitization by age 12, we used logistic regression (see Methods S1). For airborne fungal taxa measurable at but not below the 75th percentile, we conducted sensitivity analyses considering these exposures as discrete categorical variables (e.g. ≥75th percentile vs. below the 75th percentile). We used SAS 9.2 (SAS Institute, Inc, Cary, NC, USA) for all analyses.

Results

Cohort and home characteristics

Population and home characteristics have been described previously [15, 16, 28]. Of the 499 children,

82% were followed through 12–13 years of age. The children with complete follow-up were not different to the full cohort with respect to outcomes; the prevalence of 'ever presenting with asthma', 'rhinitis', or 'wheeze' at some point by age 13 did not differ between the full cohort followed up to age 1 (N = 499) and the children with both indoor air and dust fungal exposure assessment who were included in the primary analyses (N = 208; Table 1). Lower family income, African–American race/ethnicity, and covariates linked to disadvantage were associated with loss to follow-up, which we accounted for in our models.

Compared with the 499 children, the subset of children with measures of sensitization and indoor air/dust measures (N = 265) had slightly higher rates of asthma (36% vs. 33%) and rhinitis (40% vs. 36%), but a very similar prevalence of 'ever wheeze'. The median ages for the first diagnosis of asthma, rhinitis, and the first wheeze episode were 5, 7, and 1, year(s), respectively. Twenty per cent (52/265) of children were mould sensitive when measured.

Comparing outdoor and indoor air fungal concentrations, Cladosporium, non-sporulating, and total fungal concentrations were greater in outdoor air, while Aspergillus and Penicillium were greater indoors (Table 2). For total fungi, levels in air and dust were highest in summer/fall and lowest in winter/spring. Outdoor airborne Alternaria, Cladosporium, and Penicillium were highest in summer/fall, whereas outdoor airborne yeasts were lowest in summer/fall (see Fig. S1); this was generally reflected in the indoor air patterns of the specific taxa. Forty-four per cent of families reported visible mould, water damage, or home dampness in the 12 months prior to the sampling visit during infancy. Overall, from birth through age 13, 54% of children lived in homes with visible mould, water damage, or dampness, and 37% lived in homes with reported water damage or standing water on the basement floor.

Mould and asthma

Elevated levels of dustborne yeasts in infancy were inversely associated with asthma development (hazard ratio (HR) = 0.86; 95% confidence interval (CI), [0.75–0.98]) (Table 3). In contrast, increased concentrations of indoor airborne *Alternaria* (HR = 1.48 [0.97–2.26]) and dustborne *Cladosporium* (HR = 1.17 [0.97–1.41]) were suggestive risk factors. Early-life visible dampness (HR = 0.82 [0.54–1.24]) was not associated with asthma development. In addition, total fungi in indoor air (HR = 0.91 [0.62–1.33]) or dust (HR = 1.02 [0.79–1.33]) were not associated with asthma development (N = 408). In sensitivity analyses considering indoor air *Alternaria*, indoor air *Aspergillus* and indoor air

Table 1. Subject characteristics

		Subset with indoor air and dust fungal measures and assessment of:		
			Mould	
	All children	Asthma/wheeze	sensitization	
	(N = 499)	(N = 408)	(N = 265)	
	n (%)	n (%)	n (%)	
Health outcomes by age 13	. ,		. ,	
Ever asthma	168 (33.7)	136 (33.3)	96 (36.2)	
Ever wheeze	390 (78.2)	317 (77.7)	204 (77.0)	
Ever rhinitis	181 (36.3)	146 (35.8)	106 (40.0)	
Male sex	266 (53.3)	215 (52.7)	150 (56.6)	
Ethnicity	200 (53.3)	215 (52.7)	150 (56.6)	
Caucasian	375 (75.2)	209 (7E E)	218 (82.3)	
African–American		308 (75.5)		
	59 (11.8)	49 (12.0)	22 (8.3)	
Hispanic Asian	30 (6.0)	19 (4.7)	8 (3.0)	
	28 (5.6)	26 (6.4)	12 (4.5)	
Other	7 (1.4)	6 (1.5)	5 (1.9)	
Family income <\$30k	43 (8.6)	32 (7.8)	11 (4.2)	
Parental history of asthma	256 (51.3)	211 (51.7)	131 (49.4)	
Maternal smoking during pregnancy	32 (6.4)	29 (7.1)	21 (7.9)	
Birth season				
Winter	123 (24.7)	104 (25.5)	62 (23.4)	
Spring	144 (28.9)	113 (27.7)	76 (28.7)	
Summer	111 (22.2)	89 (21.8)	61 (23.0)	
Fall	121 (24.3)	102 (25.0)	66 (24.9)	
Caesarean birth	116 (23.3)	92 (22.6)	60 (22.6)	
Low birthweight quartile	107 (21.4)	83 (20.3)	53 (20.0)	
Low-normal gestational age (≤38.5 weeks)	104 (20.8)	87 (21.3)	55 (20.8)	
Building type				
1-family detached	266 (53.3)	214 (52.5)	140 (52.8)	
1-family attached	24 (4.8)	20 (4.9)	13 (4.9)	
2-family	94 (18.8)	83 (20.3)	63 (23.8)	
≥ 3 apartments	114 (22.9)	90 (22.1)	48 (18.1)	
Elevated early-life (2-3mths) exposures				
Home dampness	219 (43.9)	180 (44.1)	119 (44.9)	
Cockroach allergen (≥2 U/g max Bla g 1 or 2	109 (21.8)	78 (19.1)	44 (16.6)	
in living room dust)				
Endotoxin (≥ median of measured samples = 81.3	202 (40.5)	162 (39.7)	111 (41.9)	
EU/mg, in living room dust)				
Dust mite allergen (≥10 μg/g Der p or f 1 baby's bed)	46 (9.2)	40 (9.8)	28 (10.6)	
Cat allergen (≥8 µg/g Fel d 1 home max)	130 (26.1)	109 (26.7)	76 (28.7)	
Detectable mouse urinary protein (living room dust)	139 (27.9)	114 (27.9)	73 (27.6)	
First year of life factors	(23)	(13)	, 3 (20)	
Day care attendance	240 (48.1)	199 (48.8)	130 (49.1)	
Bottle fed	139 (27.9)	111 (27.2)	64 (24.2)	
Lower respiratory illness	133 (26.7)	108 (26.5)	72 (27.2)	
Pet dog ownership	82 (16.4)	63 (15.4)	43 (16.2)	
Tet dog ownership	02 (10.4)	05 (15.4)	(10.2) د۲۰	

yeasts as discrete categorical variables, results were consistent, with significant protective associations for dust yeasts and a significant risk for Alternaria (HR = 1.70 [1.01-2.86] for ≥ 75 th percentile vs. below the 75th percentile) (Table S1). Results were consistent in the subset with outdoor air measurements (N = 317).

Mould and rhinitis

Higher levels of indoor bedroom dustborne Aspergillus (HR = 1.39 [1.11-1.74]) in infancy were associated with an increased risk of incident rhinitis (Table 3). In the subset with outdoor air fungal measures (n = 316), outdoor airborne Cladosporium (HR = 2.12 [1.14-3.92])

Table 2. Distributions of fungal exposures (Statistics calculated for all measured samples, including values below the limit of detection)

			25th percentile		75th percentile	IQR
Fungi	# samples	# detectable	(log _e *)	Median	(\log_e^*)	(log _e -transformed*)
Alternaria						
Outdoor air – CFU/m³	384	139	0.0 (0.0)	0.0	11.1 (2.5)	2.5
Indoor air – CFU/m³	494	124	0.0 (0.0)	0.0	11.1 (2.5)	2.5
Bedroom floor dust - CFU/g	412	236	0.0 (0.0)	454.5	3846.2 (8.3)	8.3
Cladosporium						
Outdoor air – CFU/m³	384	344	33.3 (3.5)	161.1	466.7 (6.1)	2.6
Indoor air – CFU/m³	494	384	11.1 (2.5)	44.4	211.1 (5.4)	2.9
Bedroom floor dust - CFU/g	412	322	434.8 (6.1)	3779.8	8485.7 (9.0)	2.9
Aspergillus						
Outdoor air – CFU/m³	384	131	0.0 (0.0)	0.0	11.1 (2.5)	2.5
Indoor air – CFU/m³	494	311	0.0 (0.0)	11.1	33.3 (3.5)	3.5
Bedroom floor dust - CFU/g	412	374	1304.3 (7.2)	4791.3	14 264.2 (9.6)	2.4
Penicillium						
Outdoor air – CFU/m³	384	287	0.0 (0.0)	22.2	66.7 (4.2)	4.2
Indoor air – CFU/m³	494	423	11.1 (2.5)	33.3	88.9 (4.5)	2.0
Bedroom floor dust - CFU/g	412	368	1200.0 (7.1)	3846.2	9523.8 (9.2)	2.1
Yeasts						
Outdoor air – CFU/m³	384	120	0.0 (0.0)	0.0	11.1 (2.5)	2.5
Indoor air – CFU/m³	494	172	0.0 (0.0)	0.0	11.1 (2.5)	2.5
Bedroom floor dust - CFU/g	412	367	2600.6 (7.9)	8496.2	25 000.0 (10.1)	2.2
Non-sporulating						
Outdoor air – CFU/m³	384	353	22.2 (3.1)	77.8	266.7 (5.6)	2.5
Indoor air – CFU/m³	494	373	11.1 (2.5)	22.2	88.9 (4.5)	2.0
Bedroom floor dust - CFU/g	412	380	2390.5 (7.8)	6451.6	19 139.2 (9.9)	2.1
Total						
Outdoor air – CFU/m³	384	382	211.1 (5.4)	533.3	972.2 (6.9)	1.5
Indoor air – CFU/m³	494	492	100.0 (4.6)	300.0	588.9 (6.4)	1.8
Bedroom floor dust - CFU/g	412	412	24 791.3 (10.1)	71 633.3	13 7416.7 (11.8)	1.7

^{*} \log_{e} -transformed = \log_{e} (untransformed concentration + 1); addition of 1 CFU/m³ or/g for values below the limit of detection. IQR, interquartile range.

and non-sporulating fungi (HR = 1.41 [0.97–2.06]) were also associated with an increased risk of rhinitis development. However, total fungi were not associated with rhinitis development risk.

Mould and wheeze

Over the lifetime of the children (birth to age 13), elevated levels of dustborne yeasts were associated with a lower odds of wheeze (odds ratio (OR) = 0.88; 95% confidence interval (CI), [0.80-0.96]) in repeated-measures analyses (Table 3). Results were consistent when we limited the data to the subset with outdoor air fungal exposure assessment (OR = 0.82 [0.70, 0.96]). Moreover, dustborne yeasts were negatively associated with 'any wheeze' at each of 3 age stages [age < 3 years (OR = 0.86 [0.76-0.97], n = 408); ages 3 through < 6 (OR = 0.83 [0.74-0.94], n = 394); and 6 through 13 (OR = 0.90 [0.80-1.01], n = 379)]. In contrast, there was a suggestion that elevated indoor air yeasts were associated with increased odds of wheeze in repeated-measures analyses (OR = 1.24 [0.99-1.56]). As with asthma, in sensitivity

analyses considering indoor air *Alternaria*, indoor air *Aspergillus* and indoor air yeasts as discrete categorical variables, results were consistent, with significant protective associations for dust yeasts and a significant risk for *Alternaria* (OR = 1.47 [0.00-2.14] for ≥ 75 th percentile vs. below the 75th percentile) (Table S1).

Independent of fungal exposures, in repeated-measures analyses, wheeze over the lifetime of the children was not associated with reports of visible dampness in the year prior to the home visit in infancy (OR = 1.05 [0.77–1.42]) or in the year of or before the symptom report (results not shown).

All associations for wheeze, asthma, and rhinitis were independent of gender, ethnicity, low total annual family income, birth season, Caesarean birth, low birth weight quartile, low-normal gestational age, bottle feeding in bed/crib in first year of life, lower respiratory illness in first year of life, physician-diagnosed parental history of asthma, maternal smoking during pregnancy, building type, early-life exposures to cockroach, dust mite, cat, and mouse allergens (as suggested by dust levels); dog ownership; dust endotoxin; and day care in the first year of life.

Table 3. Associations between Early-Life Fungi and Dampness with Development of Asthma and Rhinitis, Repeated Measures of Wheeze by Age 13, and Sensitization by Age 12 (Analyses evaluate associations of home dampness and all listed fungal genera jointly)

	Current Asthma*	Current Rhinitis*	Any Wheeze [†]	Mould Sensitization [‡]
	Cox Proportional Ha		Generalized Estimating Equations (baseline $n = 408$; total obs. = 4809) OR 95% CI [§]	Logistic Regression
	(n = 408) HR 95% CI [§]	(n = 406) HR 95% CI [§]		(n = 265) OR 95% CI [§]
Home Dampness asked at early-life home visit	0.82 (0.54, 1.24)	1.11 (0.73, 1.68)	1.05 (0.77, 1.42)	1.66 (0.84, 3.28)
Alternaria				
Indoor air (log _e CFU/m³)	1.48 (0.97, 2.26)	1.07 (0.70, 1.65)	1.29 (0.95, 1.76)	1.03 (0.51, 2.07)
Dust – bedroom floor (log _e CFU/g)	1.17 (0.74, 1.84)	0.79 (0.51, 1.22)	0.96 (0.70, 1.32)	1.57 (0.75, 3.27)
Cladosporium				
Indoor air (log _e CFU/m³)	0.97 (0.64, 1.45)	0.82 (0.54, 1.25)	0.94 (0.71, 1.26)	1.08 (0.56, 2.09)
Dust – bedroom floor (log _e CFU/g)	1.17 (0.97, 1.41)	0.91 (0.77, 1.08)	1.10 (0.97, 1.24)	1.11 (0.82, 1.51)
Aspergillus				
Indoor air (log _e CFU/m³)	1.19 (0.79, 1.78)	1.08 (0.72, 1.63)	1.20 (0.88, 1.63)	0.64 (0.34, 1.23)
Dust – bedroom floor (loge CFU/g)	0.99 (0.83, 1.19)	1.39 [¶] (1.11, 1.74)	1.05 (0.92, 1.20)	1.04 (0.79, 1.38)
Penicillium				
Indoor air (log _e CFU/m³)	0.90 (0.69, 1.17)	1.01 (0.76, 1.33)	0.95 (0.79, 1.14)	0.88 (0.58, 1.33)
Dust – bedroom floor (log _e CFU/g)	0.92 (0.80, 1.07)	1.04 (0.89, 1.21)	1.00 (0.90, 1.11)	1.08 (0.84, 1.39)
Yeasts				
Indoor air (log _e CFU/m³)	1.13 (0.82, 1.56)	0.73 (0.51, 1.04)	1.24 (0.99, 1.56)	0.95 (0.54, 1.66)
Dust – bedroom floor (log _e CFU/g)	0.86 (0.75, 0.98) [¶]	1.06 (0.92, 1.22)	0.88 (0.80, 0.96) [¶]	0.82 (0.66, 1.01)
Non-Sporulating Fungi				
Indoor air (log _e CFU/m³)	0.90 (0.71, 1.15)	1.15 (0.90, 1.46)	0.95 (0.80, 1.12)	1.13 (0.78, 1.64)
Dust – bedroom floor (loge CFU/g)	1.04 (0.86, 1.24)	1.05 (0.88, 1.25)	1.11 (0.97, 1.28)	1.04 (0.77, 1.41)

^{*}Models for asthma and rhinitis adjust for male gender (yes/no), African-American ethnicity (yes/no), low total annual family income (<\$30k), birth season (4 categories, ref: winter), Caesarean birth (yes/no), low birthweight quartile (yes/no), low-normal gestational age (≤38.5 weeks), bottle fed in bed/crib in first year of life (yes/no), lower respiratory illness in first year of life (yes/no), physician-diagnosed parental history of asthma (yes/no), maternal smoking during pregnancy (yes/no), building type (1-family detached/1-family attached/2-family/≥ 3 apartments), and missing indicators for family income (3.2%) and parental asthma (1.2%).

All associations are independent of, and not confounded by high early life (2−3 months) cockroach allergen (≥2 U/g max Bla g 1 or 2 in living room dust), endotoxin (≥ median of measured samples = 81.3 EU/mg, in living room dust), dust mite allergen (≥10 μg/g Der p or f 1 baby's bed), cat allergen (≥8 μg/g Fel d 1 home max), detectable mouse urinary protein (living room dust), and day care attendance or pet dog ownership in the first year of life.

HR, hazard ratio; OR, odds ratio; CI, confidence interval; obs., observations.

Mould sensitization

Elevated levels of dustborne yeasts were negatively associated with mould sensitization (OR = 0.82 [0.66-1.01], (N = 265)). All of the children sensitized to mould were sensitized to ≥1 other allergen (cat, dog, mouse, cockroach, dust mite, tree, ryegrass, and/or ragweed), so we were unable to adjust for 'any atopy'. Total fungi in indoor air (OR = 1.13 [0.62-2.07]) and dust (OR = 1.16)[0.79–1.70]) were not associated with mould sensitization.

Maternal mould sensitization significantly modified (increased) the odds of mould sensitization by age 12 with exposures to higher fungal dust levels in infancy (OR = 4.77 [1.55-14.68] versus OR = 1.29 [0.60-2.78];for Alternaria) (OR = 1.33 [0.94-1.87] vs. OR = 1.01[0.76–1.33]; for *Aspergillus*).

Discussion

Elevated dustborne yeasts levels in infant bedrooms were consistently and strongly associated with lower prevalence of wheeze at every life stage, with lower risk of development of asthma by age 13, and with mould sensitization by age 12. In contrast, increased levels of

[†]Model for wheeze also adjusts for age², gender, and their interactions, in addition to covariates in models for asthma and rhinitis.

^{*}Model for sensitization adjusts for birth season (4 categories, ref: winter), low-normal gestational age (≤38.5 weeks), maternal sensitivity to mould (Alternaria/Aspergillus) at birth (yes/no), lower respiratory illness in first year of life (yes/no), and building type (1-family detached/1-family attached/2-family/ \geq 3 apartments).

[§]Hazard or odds ratios for the presence of home dampness or an interquartile increase in the log-transformed fungal concentration.

[¶]P < 0.05.

members of several genera known to be associated with reduced asthma control in school-aged children [3] (e.g. Cladosporium, Aspergillus, Alternaria) were also risk factors for rhinitis or (more weakly) for asthma development in our cohort. Maternal mould sensitization status at the birth of their child modified the association between elevated early-life dustborne Alternaria and Aspergillus exposures and mould sensitization by age 12. Occupant-reported dampness was neither associated with fungal concentrations [38] nor was it consistently associated with wheeze, asthma, or rhinitis in our cohort.

Ours is one of the most comprehensive birth cohort studies supporting the hypothesis that early life is a critical period when fungal exposures can influence the development of asthma and allergy up to the teen years. Longitudinal studies of individual fungal genera, rather than total fungi or home dampness, can differentiate potentially protective fungal types from those that increase disease risk. Among the few previous studies on the role of early-life fungi in respiratory disease development beyond early childhood, many were crosssectional or case-control in design. In the BAMSE longitudinal birth cohort study of 4089 Swedish children, the odds of recurrent wheezing by age 2 years were associated with early-life (age 2-months) mould odour (OR = 2.0 [1.0-3.9]) [7]. However, that study relied on parental reports of both exposure and outcome. We did rely on parental report of home dampness, but had objective measures of fungi.

In a matched case-control study of 251 cases and their controls from a cohort study of 3754 Norwegian children, Nafstad et al. found investigator-confirmed dampness to be a significant determinant of bronchial obstruction (OR = 3.8 [2.0-7.2]) [39]. Although this study adjusted for dust mite exposure, there was no measure of specific species-level fungal concentrations, and children were followed up to age 2 [39]. A Finnish retrospective study of 121 cases and 241 controls aged 1-7 years found that the odds of physician-diagnosed asthma were associated with engineer-reported severity of moisture damage, visible mould or mould odour [40]. The principal strength of that study was having objective measures of severity of moisture damage. We relied solely on parental report of dampness, and it is likely that our subjective home dampness reports included a wide range of dampness severity. While chronic dampness in homes is an established risk factor for asthma development in childhood [41, 42], it is believed to represent a host of microbial exposures and sources of allergens that thrive and multiply in damp conditions. In our cohort, in a number of prior publications, we have demonstrated that, as expected, our metrics of home dampness or its sources are predictors of our exposures of interest – particularly home endotoxin and dust fungal levels [43, 44]. However, in all of our longitudinal analyses, the microbiota or allergens themselves and not the conditions fostering their growth have been the more robust predictors of a variety of respiratory health outcomes.

Dustborne versus airborne yeasts

Environmental exposures may have opposing influences on allergic or asthmatic responses, depending on the compartment exposed, the dose received, the timing of the dose or susceptibility of the subject. Yeast exposures are not exception. Dustborne yeasts may have been ingested as well as inhaled by infants in early life. Immune responses in the gut are key to development of immune tolerance [45]. Probiotic yeasts [46] and glucans [47] are Toll-like receptor stimulants that may protect against early-life allergen when ingested. In contrast, allergy to baker's yeast is a documented phenomenon [48], and aerosolized yeasts may provoke irritant as well as allergic inflammatory airway responses when inhaled. With hand-to-mouth behaviours in infancy, the children in our cohort may have had gastrointestinal compartment-specific immune responses to the dustborne yeasts in their bedroom, with development of tolerance on ingestion of yeast. Dustborne veasts were also associated with reduced sensitization, suggesting that their protective association with wheeze and asthma development may have been mediated through reduced allergy. Given the lack of association of airborne yeasts with sensitization, their association with increased wheeze, particularly in early childhood [20], may reflect a compartment-specific irritant rather than an allergic airway response. Level and persistence of dose as well as compartment of exposure may also be responsible for differences in the relation of dust, compared to airborne yeasts, with health outcomes. The 75th percentile of airborne yeasts was equivalent to the lower limit of detection (i.e. 11 CFU/m³) which could mean that the airborne concentrations of yeasts are not as high (relatively speaking) and as constant as are the exposures to veasts in dust.

There are over 1500 species of yeasts and yeast-like fungi, a phylogenetically diverse group of mainly unicellular fungi [49]. Variability in pathogen-associated molecular patterns (PAMPs) both within yeast species and between unicellular (e.g. yeasts) and multicellular fungi may differentially stimulate innate responses [50]. Given the diversity of yeasts, it is also feasible in our study that airborne and dustborne yeast communities differed taxonomically, functionally, or structurally in ways that may have influenced their immunologic or physiologic effects [51]. Molecular microbiologic studies may elucidate specific components of innate

microbiologic stimulants that lead to contrasting effects on respiratory and allergic disease development.

Towards an understanding of protective microbial associations: beyond measurement of total fungal levels

Our study adds specificity to the hygiene hypothesis literature, suggesting that microbial organisms or their components may protect against asthma and allergy development [6, 9-13, 52, 53]. Tischer et al. found that among children with parental allergy, an increase in [1,3]-β-D-glucan exposure sampled from children's mattresses and living room floors at age 5 was negatively associated with physician-diagnosed allergic rhinitis (OR = 0.58 [0.37-0.91]) at age 6 [8]. As well as compartment or timing of exposure, differential levels of biologically active fungal glucan between genera [54] and different types of yeasts [55] may explain the variable health outcomes associated with early-life fungal exposures [56].

Osborne et al. measured indoor and outdoor air, but not dust, samples for 144 at-risk children, aged between 1 and 3 years [56]. They then cross-sectionally tested the association between total fungi and the four most frequent genera with health outcomes in separate logistic regression models. While total airborne fungal concentrations were not associated with increased sensitization, sensitization was associated with higher levels of Alternaria and Penicillium or Aspergillus type spores, but lower levels of Cladosporium.

Study limitations

Our analytical technique required spores be culturable, but non-viable/non-culturable spores and fungal fragments and non-living cellular material can also carry allergens and other immunomodulatory agents. Newer molecular methods may improve fungal exposure assessment [57] and assessment of the functional components of yeasts and other fungi that may be protective against some allergic disease, depending on the timing and mode of exposure. At this time, however, the use of community sequencing of diagnostic regions of the fungal rRNA gene remains underexploited for epidemiologic studies.

While we have repeated outcome measures, we are limited by fungal exposures measured only in early life. Moreover, dust samples may be more representative than single short-term air samples of biologically relevant long-term exposures to fungi. This was highlighted in an earlier manuscript from our study where we found that concentrations of fungi in duplicate samples were highly correlated for dust samples and to a lesser extent in air samples [38].

There is a growing body of evidence that sensitization to some fungi is associated with a more severe phenotype of asthma [58, 59]. We assessed whether early-life fungal exposures were associated with sensitization to species of any of the genera Alternaria, Cladosporium, Aspergillus, or Penicillium, rather than to a specific genus. However, children sensitized to fungi tend to be atopic to species in >1 genus and are also more likely to be sensitized to other aeroallergens [60]. With a larger sample size (and non-cross-reactive fungal antigen extracts), we might have been able to evaluate fungal exposure associations with species-specific sensitization. In another analysis of early-life fungi and wheeze by age one [20], we validated models using the Lasso approach [61], reducing the probability of chance findings due to multiple comparisons. Therefore, we evaluated the internal consistency of findings across outcomes and exposures, and the biological plausibility of these joint findings, which helps minimize the probability of type I errors.

Conclusions

In one of the most comprehensive longitudinal birth cohort studies following children through age 13 and controlling for loss to follow-up, visible reports of home dampness, and other indoor environmental exposures, we have highlighted the role of early-life fungal exposures in the development of wheeze, asthma, rhinitis, and sensitization. While several specific genera were risk factors, dustborne yeasts appeared protective of early onset and persistent wheeze, asthma development by age 13, and mould sensitization by age 12. The influences of fungi may vary by form, taxonomically patterned functional differences, by timing, dose, or mode of exposure, or by inherited susceptibility factors. Molecular microbiologic studies may elucidate specific components of innate microbiologic stimulants that lead to contrasting effects on disease development.

Acknowledgements

The authors thank the families who have participated in this project. We also thank Professor Petros Koutrakis for his support as part of Behrooz Behbod's doctoral thesis committee. This manuscript has been supported by the following grants: R01 AI035786, EPA RD-83241601, and AI-20565. Dr Behbod's doctorate has been supported by the Harvard-Cyprus Endowment Scholarship.

Conflict of interests

There are no conflicts of interests.

References

- 1 Rylander R, Etzel R. Introduction and summary: workshop on children's health and indoor mold exposure. *Environ Health Perspect* 1999; 107:465.
- 2 Silvers A, Florence BT, Rourke DL, Lorimor RJ. How children spend their time: a sample survey for use in exposure and risk assessments. *Risk Anal* 1994; 14:931–44.
- 3 Tischer C, Chen CM, Heinrich J. Association between domestic mould and mould components, and asthma and allergy in children: a systematic review. *Eur Respir J* 2011a; 38:812–24.
- 4 Celedón JC, Milton DK, Ramsey CD *et al.* Exposure to dust mite allergen and endotoxin in early life and asthma and atopy in childhood. *J Allergy Clin Immunol* 2007; 120:144–9.
- 5 Fisk WJ, Lei-Gomez Q, Mendell MJ. Meta-analyses of the associations of respiratory health effects with dampness and mold in homes. *Indoor Air* 2007: 17:284–96.
- 6 Douwes J, van Strien R, Doekes G et al. Does early indoor microbial exposure reduce the risk of asthma? The Prevention and Incidence of Asthma and Mite Allergy birth cohort study. J Allergy Clin Immunol 2006; 117:1067–73.
- 7 Emenius G, Svartengren M, Korsgaard J, Nordvall L, Pershagen G, Wickman M. Indoor exposures and recurrent wheezing in infants: a study in the BAMSE cohort. *Acta Paediatr* 2004; 93:899–905.
- 8 Tischer C, Gehring U, Chen CM *et al.* Respiratory health in children, and indoor exposure to (1,3)-β-D-glucan, EPS mould components and endotoxin. *Eur Respir J* 2011b; 37:1050–9.
- 9 Gehring U, Heinrich J, Hoek G et al. Bacteria and mould components in house dust and children's allergic sensitisation. Eur Respir J 2007; 29:1144– 53.
- 10 Iossifova YY, Reponen T, Bernstein DI *et al.* House dust (1-3)-beta-D-glucan and wheezing in infants. *Allergy* 2007; 62:504–13.
- 11 Iossifova YY, Reponen T, Ryan PH *et al.* Mold exposure during infancy as a predictor of potential asthma

- development. *Ann Allergy Asthma Immunol* 2009; 102:131–7.
- 12 Schram-Bijkerk D, Doekes G, Douwes J *et al.* Bacterial and fungal agents in house dust and wheeze in children: the PARSIFAL study. *Clin Exp Allergy* 2005; 35:1272–8.
- 13 von Mutius E, Braun-Fahrlander C, Schierl R et al. Exposure to endotoxin or other bacterial components might protect against the development of atopy. Clin Exp Allergy 2000; 30:1230–4.
- 14 Ege MJ, Mayer M, Normand AC et al. Exposure to environmental microorganisms and childhood asthma. N Engl J Med 2011; 364:701–9.
- 15 Gold DR, Burge HA, Carey V, Milton DK, Platts-Mills TAE, Weiss ST. Predictors of repeated wheeze in the first year of life. The relative roles of cockroach, birth weight, acute lower respiratory illness, and maternal smoking. *Am J Respir Crit Care Med* 1999; 160:227–36.
- 16 Stark PC, Burge HA, Ryan LM, Milton DK, Gold DR. Fungal levels in the home and lower respiratory tract illnesses in the first year of life. Am J Respir Crit Care Med 2003; 168:232–7.
- 17 Verhoeff AP, van Reenen-Hoekstra ES, Samson RA, Brunekreef PJ, van Wijnen JH. Fungal propagules in house dust. I. Comparison of analytic methods and their value as estimators of potential exposure. *Allergy* 1994; 49:533–9.
- 18 von Arx JA. *The genera of fungi sporulating in pure culture*. Lehre, Germany: Verlag von J Cramer, 1970.
- 19 Barnett HL, Hunter BB. Illustrated genera of imperfect fungi. 3rd edn. Minneapolis, MN: Burgess Publishing, 1972.
- 20 Behbod B, Sordillo JE, Hoffman EB *et al.* Wheeze in infancy: protection associated with yeasts in house dust contrasts with increased risk associated with yeasts in indoor air and other fungal taxa. *Allergy* 2013; 68:1410–8. doi:10.1111/all.12254.
- 21 Celedón JC, Litonjua AA, Ryan L, Weiss ST, Gold DR. Day care attendance, respiratory tract illnesses, wheezing, asthma, and total serum IgE level in early childhood. *Arch Pediatr Adolesc Med* 2002a; 156:241–5.
- 22 Celedón JC, Litonjua AA, Ryan L, Weiss ST, Gold DR. Bottle feeding in

- the bed or crib before sleep time and wheezing in early childhood. *Pediatrics* 2002b: 110:e77.
- 23 Celedón JC, Wright RJ, Litonjua AA et al. Day care attendance in early life, maternal history of asthma, and asthma at the age of 6 years. Am J Respir Crit Care Med 2003; 167:1239– 43.
- 24 Litonjua AA, Carey VJ, Burge HA, Weiss ST, Gold DR. Parental history and the risk for childhood asthma. Does mother confer more risk than father? Am J Respir Crit Care Med 1998; 158:176–81.
- 25 Litonjua AA, Carey VJ, Burge HA, Weiss ST, Gold DR. Exposure to cockroach allergen in the home is associated with incident doctor diagnosed asthma and recurrent wheezing. J Allergy Clin Immunol 2001; 107:41–7.
- 26 Litonjua AA, Milton DK, Celedón JC, Ryan L, Weiss ST, Gold DR. A longitudinal analysis of wheezing in young children: the independent effects of early life exposure to house dust endotoxin, allergens, and pets. J Allergy Clin Immunol 2002; 110:736–42.
- 27 Ly NP, Gold DR, Weiss ST, Celedón JC. Recurrent wheeze in early childhood and asthma among children at risk for atopy. *Pediatrics* 2006: 117:e1132–8.
- 28 Park JH, Gold DR, Spiegelman DL, Burge HA, Milton DK. House dust endotoxin and wheeze in the first year of life. *Am J Respir Crit Care Med* 2001; 163:322–8.
- 29 Phipatanakul W, Celedón JC, Hoffman EB, Abdulkerim H, Ryan LM, Gold DR. Mouse allergen exposure, wheeze and atopy in the first seven years of life. *Allergy* 2008; 63:1512–8.
- 30 Pistiner M, Gold DR, Abdulkerim H, Hoffman EB, Celedón JC. Birth by Cesarean section, allergic rhinitis, and allergic sensitization among children with a parental history of atopy. *J Allergy Clin Immunol* 2008; 122:274–9.
- 31 Ramsey CD, Gold DR, Litonjua AA, Sredl DL, Ryan L, Celedón JC. Respiratory illnesses in early life and asthma and atopy in childhood. J Allergy Clin Immunol 2007; 119:150–6.
- 32 Stark PC, Celedón JC, Chew GL *et al.* Fungal levels in the home and allergic rhinitis by 5 years of age. *Environ Health Perspect* 2005; 113:1405–9.

- 33 Lewis SA, Weiss ST, Platts-Mills TAE, Syring M, Gold DR. Association of specific allergen sensitization with socioeconomic factors and allergic disease in a population of Boston women. J Allergy Clin Immunol 2001: 107:615-22.
- 34 Stein RT, Martinez FD. Asthma phenotypes in childhood: lessons from an epidemiological approach. Paediatr Respir Rev 2004; 5:155-61.
- 35 Cox DR. Regression models and lifetables. J Roy Statist Soc Ser B (Methodol) 1972; 34:187-220.
- 36 Zeger SL, Liang KY, Albert PS. Models for longitudinal data: a generalized estimating equation approach. Biometrics 1988; 44:1049-60.
- 37 Fitzmaurice GM, Laird NM, Ware JH. Applied longitudinal analysis. Hoboken, New Jersey: John Wiley & Sons, Inc., 2004:375-400.
- 38 Chew GL, Rogers C, Burge HA, Muilenberg ML, Gold DR. Dustborne and airborne fungal propagules represent a different spectrum of fungi with differing relations to home characteristics. Allergy 2003; 58:13-20.
- 39 Nafstad P, Oie L, Mehl R et al. Residential dampness problems and symptoms and signs of bronchial obstruction in young Norwegian children. Am J Respir Crit Care Med 1998; 157:410-4.
- 40 Pekkanen J, Hyvarinen A, Haverinen-Shaughnessy U, Korppi M, Putus T, Nevalainen A. Moisture damage and childhood asthma: a population-based incident case-control study. Eur Respir J 2007; 29:509–15.
- 41 World Health Organization. 2009. WHO auidelines for indoor air auality dampness and mould. Copenhagen, Denmark: WHO Regional Office for Europe. Available at: http://www.euro. who.int/document/E92645.pdf. Accessed April 6, 2014.
- 42 Quansah R, Jaakkola MS, Hugg TT, Heikkinen SAM, Jaakkola JJK. Residential dampness and molds and the

- risk of developing asthma: a systematic review and meta-analysis. PLoS ONE 2012; 7:e47526.
- 43 Sordillo JE, Alwis UK, Hoffman E, Gold DR, Milton DK. Home characteristics as predictors of bacterial and fungal microbial biomarkers in house dust. Environ Health Perspect 2011; 119:189-95.
- 44 Park JH, Spiegelman DL, Burge HA, Gold DR, Chew GL, Milton DK. Longitudinal study of dust and airborne endotoxin in the home. Environ Health Perspect 2000; 108:1023-8.
- 45 Noverra MC, Huffnagle GB. Does the microbiota regulate immune responses outside the gut? Trends Microbiol 2004: 12:562-8.
- 46 Kourelis A, Kotzamanidis C, Litopoulou-Tzanetaki E, Papaconstantinou J, Tzanetakis N, Yiangou M. Immunostimulatory activity of potential probiotic yeast strains in the dorsal air pouch system and the gut mucosa. J Appl Microbiol 2010; 109:260-71.
- 47 Kimura Y, Sumiyoshi M, Suzuki T, Suzuki T, Sakanaka M. Inhibitory effects of water-soluble low-molecular-weight β-(1,3–1,6)D-glucan purified Aureobasidium pullulans GM-NH-1A1 strain on food allergic reactions in mice. Int Immunopharmacol 2007; 7:963-72.
- 48 Baldo BA, Baker RS. Inhalant Allergies to Fungi: reactions to Bakers' Yeast (Saccharomyces cerevisiae) and Identification of Bakers' Yeast Enolase as an Important Allergen. Int Arch Allergy Immunol 1988; 86:201-8.
- 49 Kurtzman CP, Fell JW. Yeast systematics and phylogeny—implications of molecular identification methods for studies in ecology. In: Biodiversity and Ecophysiology of Yeasts, The Yeast Handbook, Springer, 2006: Berlin, pages 11-30.
- 50 Kaisho T, Akira S. Toll-like receptor function and signaling. J Allergy Clin Immunol. 2006;117:979-87; quiz 988.

- 51 Kendrick B. The fifth kingdom. 2nd edn. Waterloo, Canada: Mycologue Publications, 1992.
- 52 Liu AH, Leung DYM. Renaissance of the hygiene hypothesis. J Allergy Clin Immunol 2006: 117:1063-6.
- 53 Ege MJ, Mayer M, Normand AC et al. Exposure to environmental microorganisms and childhood asthma. N Engl J Med 2011; 364:701-9.
- 54 Foto M, Plett J, Berghout J, Miller JD. Modification of the Limulus amebocyte lysate assay for the analysis of glucan in indoor environments. Anal Bioanal Chem 2004; 379:156-62.
- 55 Kim KS, Chang JE, Yun HS. Estimation of soluble β-glucan content of yeast cell wall by the sensitivity to Glucanex® 200G treatment. Enzyme Microb Technol 2004; 35:672-7.
- 56 Osborne M, Reponen T, Adhikari A et al. Specific fungal exposures, allergic sensitization, and rhinitis in infants. Pediatr Allergy Immunol 2006; 17:450-7.
- 57 Vesper S. Traditional mould analysis compared to a DNA-based method of mould analysis. Crit Rev Microbiol 2011: 37:15-24.
- 58 Fairs A, Agbetile J, Hargadon B et al. IgE sensitization to Aspergillus fumigatus is associated with reduced lung function in asthma. Am J Respir Crit Care Med 2010: 182:1362-8.
- 59 Menzies D, Holmes L, McCumesky G, Prys-Picard C, Niven R. Aspergillus sensitization is associated with airflow limitation and bronchiectasis in severe asthma. Allergy 2011; 66:679-85.
- 60 Kidon M. See Y. Goh A. Chay O. Balakrishnan A. Aeroallergen sensitization in pediatric allergic rhinitis in Singapore: is air conditioning a factor in the tropics? Pediatr Allergy Immunol 2004; 15:340-3.
- 61 Tibshirani R. The Lasso method for variable selection in the Cox model. Statist Med 1997; 16:385-95.

Supporting Information

Additional Supporting Information may be found in the online version of this article:

Figure S1. The distribution of airborne (indoor/outdoor) and dustborne (bedroom floor dust) fungal concentrations by sampling season, at the homes of

children (age 2-3 months) in the Epidemiology of Home Allergens and Asthma Study.

Table S1. Associations between Early-Life Fungi and Dampness with Development of Asthma & Rhinitis, Repeated Measures of Wheeze by Age 13 and Sensitization by Age 12.